

**Carnap Edition Meeting**  
27- 28 April 2002  
University Club, Chicago  
**Minutes**

**Present:** Steve Awodey, André Carus, Richard Creath, Michael Friedman, Warren Goldfarb, Thomas Ricketts

**Absent:** Alan Richardson, Sandy Zabell

An agenda was provided (in bold below), and the discussion and decisions followed in that order.

**1) What to include in the edition?**

- a) bilingual for non-English items?** Yes.
- b) if so use unpublished German originals where available (e.g. Schrödinger paper)?**  
Go with the German original and English.
- c) how much of other participants' contributions to discussions, interchanges to include (e.g. "Reply to Linsky", interchange w. Goodman, Königsberg disc., Schilpp vol.)?** Include the Königsberg discussion and in general more of the early examples.
- d) logic textbooks (*Abriss* and *Introduction to Symbolic Logic*)?** Yes on the *Abriss* and yes also on the *Introduction to Symbolic Logic* (English version) but no on the German version of that. Include lots of apparatus with the English version.
- e) mimeographed notes (e.g. "Notes for Semantics", discussion with Sellars on Physicalism)?** In general against notes and mimeos, but for the discussion with Sellars.
- f) posthumously published items intended for publication (e.g. entropy essays)?**  
Entropy probably not; probability definitely yes.
- g) items not in Benson bibliography (newspaper articles, letters to editors, etc.)?**  
Include newspaper articles and letters to editors.

**2) Translations**

- a) which ones to edit, which to do from scratch? (candidates for latter: *Syntax*, "On the character of philosophic problems")** *Aufbau*, amend; *Syntax*, from the ground up; use the original where available.
- b) difficulty of finding translators; strategies for recruitment** Left unresolved.
- c) how to arrive at standard terminology across translations?** There should be a list of uniform terms on our website, but whether these would include philosophic or only technical terms was left unresolved.
- d) how to monitor and review? procedure?** Everyone on the editorial board should read everything. (*Syntax* is the chief problem.) All the translations should be checked.

### 3) Apparatus

**a) what should introductions include? one introduction per volume?** Clump introductions: not one for each paper, but more than one for each volume. Introductions should appear before the first paper to which they are introductions. Works need not be chronological within a volume. For example reviews might be at the end of the section to which they “belong”. An outside person might be brought in as section editor or volume editor but only with the approval of the whole board. In general there will be one editor for a whole volume. [But see 5)b).] It was suggested that a citation format might be using italicized author and date as the title of a paper.

**b) explanatory notes, esp. for technical items? criteria? variant readings?** No format was given but we should record the pagination of the original. Revisions of texts may be included where Carnap’s intentions (as registered in his own copy in Pittsburgh) are known. Typos may be corrected in the text, but changes should be registered in footnotes.

**c) indices? (uniform criteria?)** There should be indices, though no decision was made on to what depth or on how to make them uniform. It was thought that in the *Aufbau* we should note which items appeared in the original index.

**d) procedure for arriving at uniform standards for apparatus across volumes** The first editor sets the precedent.

**e) procedure for monitoring and reviewing apparatus across volumes** The results should be gone over by the whole editorial committee.

### 4) Division into volumes

**a) more volumes or fewer?** See below.

**b) the proposal to be sent out with this agenda (intended only as a starting point)**

The following division into volumes was proposed: (Editors will continue to tweak this.)

- I (1922) – (1927-1)
- II *Aufbau*
- III Logic: (1927-2) and presumably (1929-2) and logic reviews and papers)
- IV Anti-metaphysics: (1928-2) – (1935-1)
- V *Logical Syntax*
- VI Logic and epistemology: (1935-2) – (1942-1)
- VII *Into. to Semantics, Formalization, Mean. and Necessity* and Supplement, “Modalities and Quantification”
- VIII (1943) – (1970) but without “Modalities and Quantification”
- IX Inductive logic
- X Inductive logic
- XI *Logical Foundations of Probability* (Stegmüller treated as variant)
- XII Carnap and Gardner plus apparatus
- XIII Schilpp volume (using a longer version of the autobiography)
- XIV Schilpp volume, part 2

## 5) Nomination and Signing-Up of Volume Editors

**a) joint or individual responsibility for volumes?** Editors of individual volumes will in general be drawn from the editorial committee. Such editors will oversee the volume, nominate section introduction writers and be responsible for securing translations. These nominations and translations will be reviewed by the committee as a whole.

**b) proposals for individual volumes** The following tentative assignments of editors was made:

- I Richardson and Friedman
- II Friedman (and Richardson?)
- III Goldfarb
- IV Creath and Ricketts (and Gabriel?)
- V Ricketts and Goldfarb
- VI Ricketts and Creath (and Gabriel?)
- VII Awodey
- VIII Open (Eric Reck might provide an introduction)
- IX Open
- X Open
- XI Open
- XII Friedman and Creath
- XIII Carus
- XIV Carus

A number of names were suggested as writers of introductions. They included:

- Berndt Buldt
- Leonard Linsky
- Eric Reck
- George Reisch
- Werner Sauer
- Teddy Seidenfeld
- Brian Skyrms
- Howard Stein

**c) decision process** As one can see many of the decisions have already been made, however tentatively. The remaining decisions can be made by the general editor in consultation with the entire board after these minutes have been distributed.

**d) approaching them and persuading them to do it** No decision was made on this except as noted below that the general editor will write to Prof. Gabriel to invite him to join the editorial board.

## 6) Logistics

**a) timetable; which volumes should come first?** Ideally I and II should come early with first volume appearing in 2004.

**b) contractual arrangements** No such arrangements were worked out and the general editor (Creath) was authorized to work out a tentative agreement with the publisher (Carus).

**c) working procedures and communication** Steve Awodey will keep files and act as webmaster. Works will be scanned into Word at ASU; Awodey will give advice on equipment and methods. The first proofreading (at ASU) will be as good as possible, but will need further proofreading in Chicago (and by everyone else involved). The question was raised as to whether every editor needs to learn TeK. It was decided that it would be better for Leslie and /or George Reisch (in Chicago) to learn it. Every one should tell Steve Awodey whether the Bernays Project is a good model for us; it can be found at the CMU website: [www.phil.cmu.edu/projects/Bernays/index.html](http://www.phil.cmu.edu/projects/Bernays/index.html) [There is also a website there for Carnap: [www.phil.cmu.edu/projects.Carnap](http://www.phil.cmu.edu/projects.Carnap) ] George Reisch has created a Carnap webpage: <http://68.20.68.40> password: Carnap [The address here is revised from that given at the meeting.]

**d) announcement (e.g. in current reprints); how to present it? names? volumes?** We should wait on announcements, though there is the possibility of a press release at next year's APA meetings (the Eastern Division is in Philadelphia) and/or at PSA (which is in November in Milwaukee).

It was suggested that individual items in the edition could be assigned and referred to by "Goldfarb numbers", consisting of an italicized name followed by a year and a letter for the order therewithin. Not all the Benson items would appear. For the time being, however, we will continue to use Benson numbers, updated according to the same plan to include items not on Benson's list.

The next tasks are to convey the scanned versions of works to Steve Awodey and determine a final list of what is whose volumes. This could be done via an updated Benson list. Rick Creath will do this. Everyone is encouraged to begin drafting introductions where that is appropriate. Rick Creath is to write to Gottfried Gabriel inviting him to join the editorial board; a copy of this letter should be sent to André Carus. Rick Creath is to write up minutes of this meeting showing decisions on individual volumes and a to do list.